

**CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF GARFIELD  
PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING  
September 11, 2019**

**Call Meeting to Order:** Chair Racine called the meeting to order at 7:00pm at the Garfield Township Hall, 3848 Veterans Drive, Traverse City, MI 49684.

**Pledge of Allegiance**

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited by all in attendance.

**Roll Call of Commission Members:**

Present: Robert Fudge, Chris DeGood, Joe Robertson, Pat Cline, Steve Duell, Joe McManus and John Racine

Staff Present: Planning Director John Sych and Deputy Planning Director Steve Hannon

**1. Public Comment (7:00)**

None

**2. Review and Approval of the Agenda – Conflict of Interest (7:02)**

*Duell moved and Fudge seconded to approve the agenda as presented.*

*Yeas: Duell, Fudge, DeGood, Cline, Robertson, McManus, Racine*

*Nays: None*

**3. Minutes (7:02)**

**a. August 28, 2019**

Duell asked to strike his comment under the second public comment.

*Duell moved and Cline seconded to adopt the minutes of August 28, 2019 as amended.*

*Yeas: Duell, Cline, Fudge, McManus, Robertson, DeGood, Racine*

*Nays: None*

**4. Correspondence (7:03)**

Emails regarding Hickory Hills.

**5. Reports (7:03)**

**Township Board Report**

Duell commented that the Chelsea Park PUD amendment was approved and the Commissioners will hear the Finding of Fact this evening. The No Wake Zone at Silver Lake is tabled at this time and no action was taken regarding a request to change the noise ordinance near Traverse City West High School.

**Planning Commissioners**

No reports

**Staff Report**

Hannon said that the online interactive GIS maps have been added to the website.

**6. Unfinished Business****a. Public Hearing – PD 2019-118 Hickory Hills SUP (7:05)**

Planner John Sych said that Hickory Hills is requesting approval of an amendment of the Special Use Permit to the Hickory Hills Recreational facility to permit additional summer uses on the site and also to amend the previously approved landscaping plan. Summer activities would be different from winter and may include such uses as a zip line, Nature Center, Yoga Retreat, summer camps for kids and a banquet center. Derek Melville and Tim Lodge, City Engineer, explained the proposed amendment and said that the process of approval for an event is very thorough. He gave a quick summary of the proposed amendment and explained the revised landscaping plan.

Chair Racine opened the Public Hearing at 7:14

*Kathy Huschke*, Executive Director of the Oleson Foundation, said Hickory Hills has received many grants from the Oleson Foundation in support of their Master Plan. She is in favor of the SUP amendment.

*Keef Morgan* of Randolph Street commented on the proposed project and shared concerns with traffic.

*Leigh Luyer* of Randolph Street shared concerns with parking and noise.

*Pat Ritola* of Fulton Street commented on the Hickory Hills project and its fiscal sustainability.

*John Nelson* of Incochee Commons shared concerns with wetland near Hickory Hills.

*Tom Bensley* of Randolph Street commented on the traffic. He gave statistics on the number of cars that drove west on Randolph Street and also shared concerns with parking not being adequate. He suggests that the proposed amendment be put on hold to see how currently planned events move forward.

*Mac McClelland*, Chair of the Hickory Hills Advisory Committee, talked about the Master Plan for Hickory Hills and explained more about the proposed SUP amendment.

*Casey Stachnik* of Randolph Street asked for more planning for traffic and parking. She asked for consideration for the neighborhood when events are scheduled and showed concern with staffing numbers.

*Margo Serrine* of Randolph Street shared concerns with traffic and speeds on Randolph Street.

*Bob Hall* of Fulton Street shared concerns with traffic on Randolph Street.

*Rick Buckolder* gave a history of how the proposal came about. He questions the ability of Hickory Hills to make the proposal work.

*Bill Brundage* of Fulton Street commented that there are some things to be fixed, but the SUP should be allowed. He asked that people support Hickory Hills and solve the problems,

*Tim Onthank* of Barney Road is in favor of the SUP amendment.  
Chair Racine closed the Public Hearing at 8:09pm.

Tim Lodge addressed concerns from the public and said that 182 parking spaces are provided and a gate has been eliminated to provide for more parking. Event applicants have to provide a number of how many people will be in attendance. Lodge said that they work with the Slabtown traffic group and have also reached out to the Road Commission to initiate no parking zones on Randolph Street. Commissioners shared concerns with parking, noise, speeds and traffic and said that parking ought to be contained on the site itself. Staff will check with the Road Commission regarding no parking signage. Commissioners asked about the provisions in the ordinance to revoke or suspend an SUP and also discussed a short term approval. Commissioners saw no issue with the proposed landscaping plan.

*Robertson moved and Cline seconded approve the revised landscaping plan dated to July 5, 2019 - project plan number 2018-10.*

*Yeas: Robertson, Cline, Duell, McManus, DeGood, Fudge, Racine*  
*Nays: None*

Sych said that conditions to the SUP could be added and would then become a part of the SUP. Staff will review parking, noise, traffic and overall management of activities and report back to commissioners at the next regular meeting.

*McManus moved and Duell seconded to postpone any action on PD 2019-118 Hickory Hills SUP at this time to gather more information.*

*Yeas: McManus, Duell, Fudge, Robertson, Cline, DeGood, Racine*  
*Nays: None*

A five minute recess as called at 9:22pm. The meeting reconvened at 9:27pm.

**b. PD 2019-115 Alpers Excavating Sand and Gravel Pit SUP Renewal – Findings**

This application requests approval of an extension of an existing Special Use Permit for an existing sand and gravel pit. Such uses are permitted via Special Use Permit in the A-Agricultural District and are also subject to supplemental use regulations and conditions in Section 774 of the Zoning Ordinance.

*DeGood moved and Duell seconded that the Findings of Fact for application SUP-2008-02-B, as presented in Planning Department Report 2019-115 and being made a part of this motion, BE ADOPTED.*

Yeas: DeGood, Duell, Cline, McManus, Fudge, Robertson, Racine  
Nays: None

*DeGood moved and Duell seconded THAT application SUP-02-B BE APPROVED and RENEWED for 10 years from the date of approval, subject to the following conditions:*

1. *All final reviews from agencies with jurisdiction shall be provided prior to any Land Use Permit being issued.*
2. *The conditions of the previous Special Use Permit will continue except that clarification of the times of truck operation shall be limited to 7:00am to 9:00pm.*
3. *A cash surety from Alpers Excavating, Inc. to the Charter Township of Garfield with the provision of the full amount of funding for restoration of the site shall be fully signed and executed.*
4. *Additional evergreen buffer as noted shall be installed.*

*Attachments included*

Yeas: DeGood, Duell, Fudge, Cline, McManus, Robertson, Racine  
Nays: None

**c. PD 2019-116 Chelsea Park West PUD Major Amendment – Findings of Fact**

Bill Crain presented the project which proposes to amend a Planned Unit Development. The application requests an amendment to increase the number of multiple family units for a total of 20 additional units. Crain reviewed the proposed amenities which include bbq patios, picnic areas, a clubhouse building, bike racks, a walking path, and a playground.

*Duell moved and Robertson seconded that the Findings of Fact for application SPR 2000-09-H, submitted by Bennett Donaldson/ JB Donaldson Company for an amendment to the Chelsea Park Planned Unit Development, be adopted.*

Yeas: Duell, Robertson, Cline, DeGood, McManus, Fudge, Racine  
Nays: None

*Duell moved and Robertson seconded that application SPR 2000-09-H, submitted by Bennett Donaldson/ JB Donaldson Company for an amendment to the Chelsea Park Planned Unit Development, BE RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL TO THE TOWNSHIP BOARD with an 11"x 17" plan set to be provided by the applicant.*

Yeas: Duell, Robertson, Cline, DeGood, McManus, Fudge, Racine  
Nays: None

- d. **PD 2019-122 – Harris Hills Site Condominium SPR 2019-04 – Update**  
 Jesse Mitchell presented the Harris Hills site condominium project which is located at the corner of Lone Tree and Harris Roads. The parcels are now rezoned R-2 – one and two family residential district. The proposed project has changed since it appeared before the Planning Commission in August. The project would now be developed under one site condominium covering both parcels with the southern parcel being developed first. Jesse Mitchell said that the project will still be completed in two phases and the first phase will be hooked into the existing sewer. The second phase may be hooked into sewer, but may need a pump system. All roads will be private and the first phase will have a fire turnaround. Staff comments were numerous and many permits and approvals still need to be sought from the County Health Department regarding the sewer hookups.

*Fudge moved and Cline seconded to table SPR 2019-04 for further information and a staff report.*

*Yeas: Fudge, Cline, Robertson, DeGood, McManus, Duell, Racine  
 Nays: None*

## 7. **New Business**

- a. **PD 2019-121 Village at LaFranier Woods Senior Living – Conceptual Review (10:13)**  
 This application is for a conceptual review of a proposed PUD for a senior housing complex located on the east side of LaFranier Road north of Hammond Road. The property is mainly level with some existing trees. The proposed development would be built in four phases with a total of 393 total units. The property is zoned A – Agricultural and is designated High Density residential. Chip Ironsides explained the project to Commissioners and said the roads would be private and the proposed density is 11.5 units per acre. Shirley Woodruff spoke about the project and said that it would be connected to water and sewer. Commissioners were favorable towards the proposed project.
- b. **PD 2019-120 Springhill Bed and Breakfast SUP – Introduction**  
 The applicant requests This Special Use Permit to use an existing single family home as a Bed and Breakfast. Bed and Breakfast establishments are permitted via SUP in the A-Agricultural zoning district.

*Duell moved and Robertson seconded THAT application SUP-2019-05 for a Special Use Permit for a bed and breakfast establishment 296 Springhill Road be scheduled for public hearing for October 9, 2019.*

*Yeas: Duell, Robertson, McManus, DeGood, Cline, Fudge, Racine  
 Nays: None*

**c. PD 2019-119 – Habitat for Humanity SUP Introduction**

This application requests approval of a Special Use Permit to expand an existing retail building, including construction of an accessory storage building, and add office uses at 2487 Rice Street. The building was recently purchased by Habitat for Humanity, which has continued to use the building for retail operations. Retail operations are permitted via SUP in the I-G district. Fred Campbell representing the client said that they need a special use permit for a resale shop. They are continuing the sales shop use and administrative office use. Sych addressed lighting, stormwater and landscaping and said that commissioners need to look at the whole site, even though a special use permit is being requested for an expansion. Commissioners discussed the stormwater management and lighting requirements. The property is hooked up to sewer, but may still have a well on the property.

*DeGood moved and Robertson seconded THAT application SUP-2019-04 for a Special Use Permit for a retail building expansion at 2487 Rice Street BE SCHEDULED for public hearing for October 9, 2019, subject to the following additional information being provided by the applicant prior to September 26, 2019 to ensure that Staff has adequate time to review the information:*

1. *A lighting and photometric plan for the site.*
  2. *Two (2) bicycle parking spaces*
  3. *Calculation of snow storage area*
  4. *Details regarding storm water for review by the Township Engineer*
  5. *Details regarding existing and proposed landscaping*
  6. *Correct parking calculations reflecting the use of the site*
  7. *Include information on storage building height*
- Attachments as specified on Planning Report PD 2019-119.*

*Yeas: DeGood, Robertson, Fudge, McManus, Duell, Cline, Racine  
Nays: None*

**8. Public Comment (11:12)**

Fred Campbell commented on the Prince of Peace Lutheran Church plan.

**9. Other Business**

- a. Cancellation of September 25, 2019 meeting

*Duell moved and Fudge seconded to cancel the September 25, 2019 Planning Commission meeting.*

*Yeas: Duell, Fudge, McManus, Cline Robertson, DeGood, Racine  
Nays: None*

**10. Items for Next Agenda –October 9, 2019**

Commissioners discussed the next agenda.



11. **Adjournment**

*Fudge moved to adjourn the meeting at 11:14pm.*



---

Joe Robertson, Secretary  
Garfield Township Planning  
Commission  
3848 Veterans Drive  
Traverse City, MI 49684