

**CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF GARFIELD
PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
August 14, 2019**

Call Meeting to Order: Chair Racine called the meeting to order at 7:00pm at the Garfield Township Hall, 3848 Veterans Drive, Traverse City, MI 49684.

Roll Call of Commission Members:

Present: Robert Fudge, Pat Cline, Steve Duell, Joe McManus and John Racine

Absent and Excused: Joe Robertson, Chris DeGood

Staff Present: Planning Director John Sych and Deputy Planning Director Steve Hannon

1. Public Comment

None

2. Review and Approval of the Agenda – Conflict of Interest (7:02)

Duell moved and Cline seconded to approve the agenda as presented.

Yeas: Duell, Cline, Fudge, McManus, Racine

Nays: None

3. Minutes (7:01)

a. July 24, 2019

Fudge moved and McManus seconded to adopt the minutes of July 24, 2019 as presented

Yeas: Fudge, McManus, Cline, Duell, Racine

Nays: None

4. Correspondence (7:02)

- a. Letter from Linda Ruttman re Alpers SUP Renewal
- b. Email from manager of GT Road Commission regarding Hammond/LaFranier
- c. Email from Don and Martha Freeman regarding Harris Hills

5. Reports (7:02)

Township Board Report

Duell commented that Ashland Park PUD was approved and two of the three proposed zoning ordinances were approved. Township Board Strategic Plan was reviewed and some discussion of the Cass Road Drain Project occurred.

Planning Commissioners

No reports

Staff Report

No reports

6. Unfinished Business**a. PD 2019-97 Alpers SUP Renewal – Public Hearing**

This application requests approval of an extension of an existing Special Use Permit for an existing sand and gravel pit. Such uses are permitted via Special Use Permit in the A-Agricultural District and are also subject to supplemental use regulations and conditions in Section 774 of the Zoning Ordinance. Bill Crain, of Crain Engineering spoke on behalf of the applicant and presented the plans for the gravel pit and future plans for the gravel pit.

Racine opened the Public Hearing at 7:09pm.

Jack Sheets of Crown Ridge Drive commented on the posted bond and asked about ongoing reclamations. He talked about the dust and thinks Alpers should keep the dust down better and urges the commission to take action to abate the dust.

Stan Simons of East Crown Drive said that the noise and dust abatement processes have not been adhered to nor have the hours of operation. He asks that Alpers abide by the agreement in place.

Rosalind Rutman of the Crown complained about the dust and noise and asked that the maintenance plan be enforced.

Hailey Hathaway of South Colonial Drive asked about the noise.

Dave Stout of Crownwood Court asks that the Planning Commission enforce the dust and hours.

Dave Landis of Crown Point Drive shared concerns with reclamation and a government authority looking at the property for environmental concerns. The Public Hearing was closed at 7:23pm.

Bill Crain addressed the questions by the public and said that the dust control plan will be managed more frequently with brining of the roads. He also stated that Alpers generally adheres to a 7am – 7pm timeframe of operation and that the gravel pit could be in business for another 20-30 years. The reclamation has been ongoing with waste soils from other building sites. Staff will look at the bond to ensure it is sufficient. Sych suggested more evergreens on the side nearest to the Crown PUD to help with the noise and dust.

Duell moved and Fudge seconded to direct Staff to prepare Findings of Fact for application SUP-2008-02-B, submitted by Alpers Excavation, Inc., for extension of an existing Special Use Permit for an existing sand and gravel pit at 2767 Zimmerman Road.

Yeas: *Duell, Fudge, McManus, Cline, Racine*

Nays: *None*

b. PD 2019-98 Chelsea Park West PUD Amendment – Public Hearing (7:45)

Bill Crain presented the project which proposes to amend a Planned Unit Development. The application requests an amendment to increase the number of multiple family units for a total of 20 additional units. Crain reviewed the proposed amenities which include bbq patios, picnic areas, a clubhouse building, bike racks, a walking path, and a playground.

The Public Hearing was opened at 7:52pm.

Kathy McGander of Chelsea Park shared concerns with traffic and asked for a traffic study.

Carl Dahlberg of the Chelsea complex said he had concerns with hours of operation, access and maintenance and also said that not many people seemed to get notice of the meeting.

Jamie Ferron from Chelsea Park asked about access from Hartman Road and asked if any of the units would cater to low incomes.

The public Hearing was closed at 8:00pm.

Sych explained the zoning enabling act and requirements for noticing.

Commissioners discussed the road and any maintenance sharing agreement. And tried also to address any questions asked by the public.

Developers of the project said that the range for rents may be \$900 – 1800 per month and that they would abide by any noise ordinance when building. Staff will look into the process for a traffic study.

McManus moved and Cline seconded to direct Staff to prepare Findings of Fact for application SPR 2000-09-H for consideration at the September 11, 2019 Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission subject to the following items being completed:

- 1. Relocate three of the bicycle parking locations and add two additional locations.*
- 2. Provide evergreens, similar to the evergreens along the south side of the property, at the back side of Building #1 which faces Hartman Road and increase the number of shrub plantings in the parking lot areas.*
- 3. Identify snow storage areas.*
- 4. Relocate the proposed entry sign as recommended.*

Yeas: McManus, Cline, Duell, Fudge, Racine

Nays: None

c. Grand Traverse Leisure – Plan Review Application (8:24)

Bill Crain of Crain Engineering and representing the applicant reviewed the proposal for an outdoor display at the existing Grand Traverse Leisure site. The site is located at 565 W. Blue Star Drive, east of US-31 and north of S. Blue Star Drive. The site is zoned C-G general Commercial and is bordered by other sites zoned C-G to the west, south, and sites zoned I-G General Industrial to the east. They propose to display large items such as hot tubs and enclosures such as gazebos. Commissioners discussed the proposal.

Duell moved and McManus seconded that application SPR2019-03 BE APPROVED, subject to the following conditions:

- 1. A final site plan shall be submitted administratively, which shall contain the landscaping details including which species, how many of each, the spacing at planting, maintenance considerations, and any other details necessary to comply with the planting material requirements of the Zoning Ordinance; and*
- 2. The final site plan shall include details per Job #140619, sheets C-1, C-2 and C-3*

Yeas: Duell, McManus, Fudge, Cline, Racine

Nays: None

7. New Business

a. PD 2019-95 Traverse City Senior Living – Conceptual Review (8:39)

Jeff Black of Traverse City is requesting a conceptual review of a proposed Planned Unit Residential Development application for a senior housing complex located on North Long Lake Road and Harris Road. The development will have 50 independent living units, 24 memory care units 20 duplexes for independent senior living, a maintenance building and a gazebo. The development area is approximately 35 acres and is zoned A-Agricultural. Sarah from North 22 commented on the proposed project and said that the proposed density is 4.9 per acre and is similar to surrounding developments. Developers are working with the Grand Traverse County Road Commission and engineering firms. Commissioners asked questions about the proposed project. The development would be divided from the parent parcel. Commissioners were positive about the proposed project.

b. PD 2019-96 LaFranier Hammond Conditional Rezoning – Conceptual Review (9:05)

This application proposes a conditional rezoning request which would facilitate the construction of a 7,200 square foot gas station, convenience store and food service on a 7.4 acre parcel on LaFranier and Hammond Roads. The parcel is zoned A-Agricultural. The parcel is master planned for high density residential. Applicant William Carey presented the proposed project and explained why they want to build the project in that particular location. Planning Commissioners discussed the proposal. Dixie Rothlesberger, owner of the parcel, spoke regarding the project and is in favor of the rezoning of the property. Richard Jaskowski asked the PC to consider placing conditions on the parcel. John Sych talked about the Master Plan and how this parcel is zoned A-Agricultural at the present time and that zoning designation's effect on the Hammond/LaFranier corridor. Commissioners also voiced concern over another gas station/convenience store in an area where there were already two in close proximity. Susan Ross, Engineer, said that there is an online

wetland delineation for the property that could be consulted. Commissioners were not in favor of the proposal.

Commissioners adjourned at 9:54pm and reconvened at 9:59pm.

c. PD 2019-99 Hickory Hills SUP Amendment – Introduction (10:00)

Tim Lodge, Traverse City Engineer, and Derek Melville from the city are requesting approval of an amendment of the Special Use Permit to the Hickory Hills Recreational facility to permit additional summer uses on the site and also to amend the previously approved landscaping plan. Summer activities would be different from winter and may include such uses as a zip line, Nature Center, Yoga Retreat, summer camps for kids and a banquet center. Staff pointed out the timing of events, the noise that they would produce, and parking. Access may be an issue and parking could also be an issue and a plan would be needed for larger events. Commissioners commented on the uses and had concerns for the neighboring properties. Melville said that the summer activities would have a very similar impact as the winter uses. Landscaping changes are the result of a newly proposed parking lot. Some of the proposed trees have been replaced with low growing shrubs and a raingarden effect in the basins is proposed.

Fudge moved and Duell seconded that application SUP-2017-04-A or an amendment to the Special Use Permit for Hickory Hills BE SCHEDULED for public hearing for September 11, 2019.

Yeas: Fudge, Duell, Cline, McManus, Racine

Nays: None

d. PD 2019-100 Harris Hills Site Condominium – Introduction (10:21)

Jesse Mitchell presented the Harris Hills site condominium project which is located at the corner of Lone Tree and Harris Roads. The parcels are now rezoned R-2 – one and two family residential district. Based on site and budget constraints, the applicant now intends to develop the north parcel as its own site condominium. The proposed project would result in 16 new single family homes in individual wells and septic systems. The second parcel will be hooked up to sewer and water. Staff said that they are expecting a review letter from the township engineer regarding the sewer and water connection. Legal counsel will review as well.

Cline moved and McManus seconded that application SPR 2019-04, submitted by Jesse E. Mitchell for a site condominium development at parcel #05-007-021-00 BE TABLED; until the following issues are resolved:

- 1. Connect to the available public sewer system if required.*
- 2. Ensure all lots meet the minimum width requirements; and*
- 3. Indicate a plan for the phased development of both parcels.*

Yeas: Cline, McManus, Duell, Fudge, Racine
Nay: None

8. **Public Comment (10:32)**

Blake Smith of Lone Beech Drive commented on the Hickory Hills proposal. He also commented on the Harris Hills ingress and egress.


Jessica Brutzman of Manitou Drive commented on the Harris Hills sewer issue and is opposed to the LaFranier gas station proposal.

9. **Other Business**

None

10. **Adjournment**

Fudge moved to adjourn the meeting at 10:47pm.



Joe Robertson, Secretary
Garfield Township Planning
Commission
3848 Veterans Drive
Traverse City, MI 49684